

PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES OF September 12, 2018
6:00 P.M. Council Chambers
745 Center Street, Milford, OH 45150

The Planning Commission of the City of Milford met in regular session on the evening of Wednesday, September 12, 2018, at Council Chambers, 745 Center Street, Milford, OH 45150.

Roll Call:

Lois McKnight called the Planning Commission meeting to order at 6:05 p.m. Other members present at tonight's meeting are Dino Pelle, Oliver Roe, and John Wenstrup. Mr. Wenstrup made a motion to excuse Fred Albrecht. Mr. Roe seconded the motion. The ayes carried.

Staff: Pam Holbrook, Asst. City Manager

Visitors: Kim Smith, MSP; Drew Case, 3168 McLean Rd., Franklin, OH 45005; Jim Lorimer, 2727 N. Central Ave., Phoenix, AZ 85002; John, Rachelle, and Liz Sora, 731 SR 28; James Patterson, 439 Main St.; Tricia Gargari, MSA; Bill Baker, MSA; Joe Schmidt, MSA; Karen Duesing, 9902 Carver Rd, Cincinnati 45242; Bruce Krone, 602 Main St., Cincinnati, 45202; Brad D'Agnillo, Kleingers

Minutes Approval:

Mr. Pelle moved to approve the July 11, 2018 minutes, seconded by Mr. Roe. The ayes carried. Ms. McKnight abstained.

Ms. McKnight stated that the City received a request from the applicants for the SEM Terrace Independent Living Units asking that their project be continued until the October Planning Commission meeting. Mr. Roe made a motion to continue case SITE 18-10 to the October Planning Commission meeting. Mr. Wenstrup seconded the motion. The ayes carried.

SITE 18-11 Sora Outdoor Storage, Hills Shopping Center, SR 28.

Ms. Holbrook read the following Staff Report into the record:

Project: Sora Outdoor Storage

Location: 749 SR 28

Property Owner: Hills Route 28 LLC
4901 Hunt Road, Ste 300
Cincinnati, OH 45242

Applicant/Agent: John Sora
Sora's Towing
749 SR 28
Milford, OH 45150

Acreage: 6.387 Ac

Tax Parcel Id: 210741.278
Zoning: B-3 General Business District
Existing Use: Retail, Office, Automotive
Proposed Use: Office and Outdoor Storage

ADJACENT LAND USE AND ZONING

North: B-3, General Business District; Commercial Use

South: O, Office District; Mobile Home Park

West: B-3, General Business District; Commercial Use

East: O, Office District; Commercial Use

PROPOSAL

John Sora, Applicant, is requesting permission to use the area to the side and rear of the Hills Shopping Center for outdoor storage of boats, trailers, RV's, Etc. The proposed storage area is an existing fenced in area that previously was used by Time Warner Cable for storage of their work vehicles at the end of the day. The tax parcel id is 210741.278 and is zoned B-3 General Business District.

ANALYSIS

Section 1181.14 addresses outdoors storage which states that the Zoning Inspector may request a Planning Commission review and approval of any outdoor storage application. The area proposed is located in a prime shopping center and Staff is concerned about the visibility from SR 28. Should Planning Commission approve this request Staff would recommend that the applicant be required to install a 10-foot-high decorative fence for any area visible from SR 28 and boat or RV storage be limited to an area behind the shopping center building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Storage of large items such as RV's and boats be limited to the area behind the building,
2. Storage area to be screened from SR 28 with a 10-foot-high decorative fence.
3. A photometric lighting plan showing footcandles at the property line, if additional lighting is to be installed. Lighting at property line not to exceed 0.5 footcandles.

Mr. Sora stated that you would not see the storage from SR 28, because the shopping center building would hide most of the storage. The storage area to the side of the building would be used for auto parking and employee parking; there are no plans to store campers, etc. in this area. Mr. Wenstrup asked whether the vehicles being parked here would be impounded or confiscated vehicles. Mr. Sora stated no, Sora's Towing would continue to use their existing lot for impounded vehicles. This new storage area would be for paid vehicle storage. Mr. Sora stated there is currently a 6-foot-high fence with barbed wire surrounding the parking area with trees along the Thielman's border. No fence upgrade is planned.

Ms. McKnight asked for clarification on staff's recommendation on the 10-foot-high decorative fence. Ms. Holbrook stated the purpose of the recommendation was to provide some additional

screening to the area closest to SR 28. There are a lot of cars in this area and it is an option to help dress up the area a bit. Ms. Holbrook noted that Time Warner had parked their service vehicles in this parking area for a number of years, however, the service vehicles are smaller than RV's.

Mr. Pelle questioned whether a decorative fence would prevent large vehicles from entering the lot. Mr. Sora stated they would install something on the gate to allow it to open for RV's. Mr. Wenstrup asked Mr. Sora whether taking steps to improve the curb appeal would reduce the cost effectiveness of the project? Mr. Sora stated a 10-foot-high fence would be expensive. A typical RV might be 10 foot tall. Mr. Wenstrup questioned whether there might be another type of screening that would be as effective. Mr. Sora stated he believed that his impound lot has nice curb appeal and is screened with a 6-foot-high fence. Mr. Sora stated he tried to keep his property very nice and clean. Ms. Holbrook agreed that the Sora's have always kept their property very neat and clean. Mr. Pelle stated the existing chain link fence appears to be very nice.

Mr. Roe stated that a 6-foot-high decorative fence may be more appropriate. Mr. Wenstrup agreed since the larger vehicles will be stored behind the building.

Mr. Roe made a motion to approve the request to provide outdoor storage in the shopping center at 749 SR 28 with the following conditions:

1. Storage of large items such as RV's and boats be limited to the area behind the building,
2. Storage area to be screened from SR 28 with a 6-foot-high decorative fence.
3. A photometric lighting plan showing footcandles at the property line, would need to be reviewed if the applicant decides to install additional lighting. Lighting at property line not to exceed 0.5 footcandles.

Mr. Wenstrup seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

SITE 18-03 Uhaul, 751 Chamber Drive.

Ms. Holbrook read the following staff report into the record:

Project: U-Haul

Location: 751 Chamber Drive

Property Owners: DeCastro Management LLC
602 Main St, Ste 302
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Applicant: MSP Design (Kim Smith)
3700 Park 42 Drive, Suite 190B
Cincinnati, OH 45241

Acreage: 5.45 Acres

Tax Parcel Ids: 210736.117
Zoning: B-3, General Business District, Planned Development
Existing Use: Parking
Proposed Use: Office, Retail, Storage, and Truck Leasing

ADJACENT LAND USE AND ZONING

1. *North: Union Township, State of Ohio*
2. *South: Union Township*
3. *East: B-3, General Business District, Planned Development; Schumacher Homes*
4. *West: B-3, General Business's District, Planned Development; Life Change Church*

ANALYSIS

Kim Smith, MSP, on behalf of Amerco Real Estate (U-Haul), is requesting approval to construct a 46,628 square foot building and five (5) smaller storage buildings on the 5.45-acre parcel to the east of 701 Chamber Drive. Proposed uses include office, retail, storage rental, and truck rental. The Milford Zoning Ordinance classifies truck rental as automotive sales which requires a conditional use approval by the Planning Commission. The tax parcel id is 210736.117 and the property is zoned B-3 General Business District, Planned Development.

Zoning

A Planned Development Overlay was approved for this area in the late 90's. The Preliminary Development Plan Design Guidelines (See attached) were approved by the City in 2000 and appear to include parcels in this area. Kerry Automotive located their dealership to 701 Chamber Drive and then expanded their vehicle area to include this lot. Easy Street Rides and Rods Motorsports located their business to this location in 2010. Life Change Church purchased the property at 701 Chamber Drive in 2018 and continue to use this adjacent parcel for overflow parking.

The Zoning Ordinance permits Office and Retail in the B-3 district. Storage rentals as a 'use' are not specifically called out in the Zoning Ordinance, but the City has several other Storage businesses located in the City; one in the B-3 General Business District and one in an Office District.

The office, retail, and the storage rental use appear to be appropriate for this area; in this case, it is a low intensity use that would not negatively impact the area. Automotive Sales is defined as "land used for the display, sale or rental of motor vehicles or trailers..." and is permitted in the B-3 district as a Conditional Use upon approval by the Planning Commission.

U-Haul currently operates a business in Downtown Milford providing truck rental/leasing. The operation in downtown Milford is considered a legal, nonconforming use. The corporate office has not confirmed whether the downtown business will be closing and relocating to the Chamber Drive location.

Conditional Use

Automotive Sales is defined as "land used for the display, sale or rental of motor vehicles or trailers..." and is permitted in the B-3 district as a Conditional Use upon approval by the Planning Commission. The following conditions apply to this use:

Automotive Sales

1. No structure shall exceed 35 feet in height.
2. All structures and activity areas, except off-street parking, shall be located no less than 40 feet from all lot lines.
3. There shall be no more than two ingress/egress drives onto the property. No drive shall exceed 35 feet in width.
4. All points of ingress/egress shall be located as far as practically possible from intersections of two or more major thoroughfares.
5. Any repair shop or establishment that is accessory to the sale of motor vehicles shall meet the conditional requirements of Automotive Repair Establishments.
6. Lubrication and other incidental servicing other than washing of motor vehicles and all supply and merchandise storage shall be completely within an enclosed building except as otherwise provided herein.
7. Lighting, including permitted illuminated signs, shall be arranged so as not to reflect or cause glare that would constitute a nuisance to any residential use or hazard to traffic on any public thoroughfare.
8. Employee vehicles and vehicles awaiting servicing or return to customers following servicing shall be parked in areas indicated for such parking on the approved site plan.
9. Parking areas and vehicle display areas shall not encroach upon any bufferyard required in Chapter 1189, Landscaping and Bufferyard Requirements.

The building exceeds the 35-foot height requirement listed above; however, Staff would suggest that the primary use of the property is office, retail, and storage rental with truck leasing as a secondary use. Staff does not have any concerns with allowing this type of activity on the site as long as all repair and maintenance is enclosed.

Staff supports this conditional use request on the condition that U-Haul relocate the automotive truck/trailer rental component of their downtown Milford operation to the Chamber Drive location.

Existing Conditions and Demolition

Sheet C101 and C102 show the existing conditions and demolition. No structures exist on site. The applicant intends to modify the existing parking layout in order to accommodate their use. Several easements exist including a private access, ingress/egress, parking, and stormwater management easement. (See attached.) A 15-foot sanitary easement is located on the north end of the property.

The applicant is proposing to move a 20-foot private fire line easement to the rear of the property. The Water Department and Fire Department have reviewed and agree with the easement relocation.

WMSC (Water Management and Sediment Control)

The Grading and Erosion Control Plan are shown on Sheet C105. The City Engineer has reviewed this plan and determined that it follows the City of Milford's Water Management and Sediment Control Ordinance requirements.

Site Plan

The Site Plan is located on Sheet C103. The applicant is proposing to construct a 46,628 square foot office, retail, and storage rental building along with one (1), 1,300 square foot self-storage building, three (3) 2,500 square feet storage units and one (1), 2,000 square foot storage unit. All buildings meeting the Zoning Ordinance setback requirements. (See Sheet C104.)

The main building will include a freight elevator, loading dock, loading ramp, a showroom, warehouse, and maintenance area. The applicant is proposing 981 storage units in all buildings. (See Sheet SP-1) 892 storage units in the main building and 89 storage units in the smaller buildings.

Access to the site is by two existing driveways off of Chamber Drive. The applicant indicates there are 141 parking spaces in which the majority are existing. Much of the parking will be used for truck rental storage including eight spaces on the north end of the property. One space near the southwest corner of the building should be eliminated to ensure Fire Department access around the building.

Traffic

Staff does not feel a traffic study is necessary for the proposed use as it appears to be a low intensity use. Trips during peak hours should fall well below the 100-vehicle threshold.

City Services

The City Engineer, Water, Wastewater, Fire and Police Departments indicate that there will not be any issues with providing services to this site nor will there be a negative impact to existing city services.

Elevations

Sheet A201 and 202 show building elevations (See attached revised storage building elevations). The applicant proposes to use a combination of split faced CMU block, MBCI Cf panels and textured stucco for the walls with architectural fenestration to break up the wall of the larger building. Staff had several conversations with the applicant regarding the use of faux windows in order to provide a visually appealing building. This item detail should be clarified at the Planning Commission meeting. The maximum building height appears to be 43 feet 6 inches which falls below the maximum permitted height in the B-3 district. The Preliminary Plan Guidelines indicate different heights for different uses however, this use does not fall under any of those use categories; Staff believes the 45-foot maximum height limit is appropriate for this use in this area of the City.

Signage will be reviewed and approved under a separate permit application. Staff recommends that the cabinet sign be changed to a channel letter sign.

Elevations for the smaller buildings are shown on Sheet A203. Storage units will be accessible on both sides of the building. Building material is shown as stucco.

Landscaping

A partial Landscape Plan is shown on Sheet L1. Design Guidelines for this review are found on the Preliminary Development Plan, Feature Area 200.3. Perimeter parking areas are to be tree lined with one tree every 50 feet and 6 shrubs for every 10 units of parking stalls. The applicant proposes to install 37 shrubs and 18 trees. Although it is not shown on this plan the applicant is requesting that no plantings be required at the northern portion of the property so that the truck rentals are visible from the street. Staff does not have concerns regarding this request given the property's history as a car dealership and its location.

The applicant shows evergreen trees on the eastern boundary in order to provide screening for the small storage units. The installed vegetation along with the existing trees and shrubs should provide a sufficient buffer.

Lighting

The applicant proposes to use the existing light poles as shown on Sheet C107. New wall pack lighting will be installed on the buildings. Footcandles at the property line are not to exceed 0.5. The photometric lighting plan on Sheet PM indicates several areas that appear to exceed the 0.5 footcandle threshold at the property line. Staff recommends that a revised lighting plan be submitted.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the conditional use with the following condition:

1. U-Haul relocate the automotive truck/trailer rental component to the Chamber Drive location.

Staff recommends approval of this request with the following conditions:

1. City approval is contingent on review and approval by the City Engineer and any other applicable local, state, and federal agencies.
2. Eliminate parking space near the southwest corner of the building to ensure Fire Department access around the building.
3. Provide additional detail regarding faux windows (architectural fenestration).
4. Change cabinet sign to channel letters.
5. Submit revised photometric lighting plan showing compliance with the 0.5 footcandle limit at the property line.
6. Property owner to ensure that all interior landscape islands are to be 100% covered with lawn, ground cover, shrubs or mulch.
7. No outdoor storage of RV's, boats, trailers, etc. is permitted other than vehicles for lease.
8. All maintenance and vehicle repair to be performed indoors.

Drew Case, U-Haul Southwest Ohio, estimated that 50 trucks and 30 trailers will be maintained on site. However, the inventory is dynamic and varies based on the time of year. Mr. Case stated they carry a local inventory of trucks and also a one-way inventory of trucks. Minor maintenance is performed on location such as safety inspections, light bulb replacement, and, topping off

fluids. Major repairs are performed at the Sharonville location. No fueling facilities are planned for this site.

Mr. Wenstrup stated that every U-Haul truck has a billboard on the truck and that is a lot of signage on Chamber Drive. Is that an outdoor sign? Mr. Case stated that the signage on the trucks are referred to as super graphics. Trucks have special graphic features and these features are highlighted on the truck along with the U-Haul name. These super graphics are part of the community and school outreach programs that U-Haul undertakes. Mr. Wenstrup stated that since we asked the previous applicant to put up a screening fence do we want to have a line of trucks along Chamber Drive. Mr. Case said we do need to display our inventory and it is an important aspect to our business.

Ms. McKnight asked whether the downtown U-Haul operation would be moved to this location. Mr. Case stated the whole objective to acquiring this location is to reposition the entire operation to this location. Amerco Real Estate will make the final decision regarding the disposition of the downtown property. Our intention is to move the entire operation to the new location. We would like to make sure that the new location is in full operation before ceasing operation in the downtown store. Mr. Wenstrup questioned whether the applicant had an issue with attaching conditions to the approval requiring all truck/vehicle leasing be moved to the Chamber Drive location. Mr. Case stated that he could not speak for Amerco Real Estate, however, the intentions are to relocate the entire operation. Ms. Holbrook stated the condition applies to the truck rental/leasing portion of the business. They could still maintain an office in the building if they chose to do so. The purpose of the condition is to take the legal, nonconforming use of truck leasing that currently exists in downtown Milford and move it to the Chamber Drive location. Mr. Case stated that all personnel will be moved to the location and we would not staff both locations.

Ms. McKnight asked the applicant to provide more detail about the faux windows. Jim Lorimer, U-Haul International, stated that the windows will be framed out like a normal window, put in an anodized aluminum frame with spandrel glass, with painted black gypsum board behind it. Mr. Roe stated that for all intents and purposes this a window with a wall behind it. Ms. McKnight stated it helps break up the façade and gives the building more of an office like feel. Mr. Wenstrup asked what would stop them from putting signage in this window? Ms. Holbrook suggested that be added to the list of conditions.

Mr. Roe asked if the new location will have an outdoor propane storage facility. Mr. Lorimer said yes. Mr. Pelle asked for more detail on the stucco paneling. Mr. Lorimer stated they are using a prefactory finished stucco textured panel, with a ribbed panel layer and high-density foam layer which helps with the insulation of the building. Mr. Pelle asked about the maintenance of the stucco; he expressed concern about the appearance of stucco over a period of time. Mr. Roe stated this material is used throughout the Rivers Edge area already. If everyone else out there has maintained it, then it would be reasonable to expect U-Haul to maintain it as well. Mr. Lorimer noted that the stucco is not a three-part system where you coat it on and then come back later for additional applications.

Mr. Lorimer stated there are 981 storage units of which 892 are within the building and 89 units are in the outside storage units. The units in the three-story building are all climate controlled with cameras and security systems. No storage will be permitted outside of an enclosed structure.

Mr. Pelle stated he felt this was a good location for the use. It allows Milford to keep a great business and it is an opportunity to remove a nonconforming use from the downtown. Mr. Roe agreed and stated he was Ok with the conditions as well as adding the condition that no signage be permitted on the faux windows. Mr. Pelle stated he loved the super graphics and felt it was great marketing. Ms. McKnight agreed and stated she did not have a problem with the trucks and the idea that every truck is a sign. Ms. McKnight noted it has great visibility from the interstate, but it is a destination location. Mr. Wenstrup asked who would be the operating manager of the store. Mr. Case stated that James Patterson currently operates the store downtown and would continue as manager of this facility.

Mr. Roe stated he did not have any issue with the super graphics. Ms. McKnight noted that condition #3 should be reworded to include: Faux Windows to be as described in the meeting. Mr. Wenstrup agreed with condition #1 under conditional uses and questioned what the assurance would be that would happen. Ms. Holbrook asked if there should be a time limit? Mr. Case stated that as long as the showroom is built out and they are able to operate at the full extent as they are operating downtown there should be no issue with moving the truck leasing business to Chamber Drive. Mr. Pelle asked how long that would take. Mr. Case stated once they had their full occupancy certificates then it is only a matter of days to move the operation over to the new store.

Mr. Roe made a motion to approve the conditional use application with the following condition:

1. U-Haul relocate the automotive truck/trailer rental component to the Chamber Drive location.

Mr. Pelle seconded the motion. The motion was approved 4-0.

Mr. Pelle made a motion to approve the site plan submittal with the following conditions:

1. City approval is contingent on review and approval by the City Engineer and any other applicable local, state, and federal agencies.
2. Eliminate parking space near the southwest corner of the building to ensure Fire Department access around the building.
3. Faux windows (architectural fenestration) to be as described in the meeting.
4. Change cabinet sign to channel letters.
5. Submit revised photometric lighting plan showing compliance with the 0.5 footcandle limit at the property line.
6. Property owner to ensure that all interior landscape islands are to be 100% covered with lawn, ground cover, shrubs or mulch.
7. No outdoor storage of RV's, boats, trailers, etc. is permitted other than vehicles for lease.
8. All maintenance and vehicle repair to be performed indoors.
9. No signage permitted on the faux windows.

Mr. Roe seconded the motion. The motion was approved 4-0.

Site 18-09 Expressway Park Redevelopment, FC Cincinnati Training Center, 689 US 50.

Ms. Holbrook read the following staff report into the record:

Project: FC Cincinnati Training Center

Location: 689 US Route 50, Milford OH

Property Owners: Parcel #1:
Bob Owens
Max Dixon Trustee
PO Box 402
Milford OH 45150

Parcel #2:
Beauty Ridge LLC
750 US Route 50
Milford, OH 45150

Applicant: The Kleingers Group
6305 Centre Park Drive
West Chester, OH 45069

Acreage: Parcel #1: 20 Acres and Parcel #2: 3.679 Acres

Tax Parcel Ids: Parcel #1: 210737.121P and Parcel #2: 210737.127P

Zoning: I, Institutional District and L-I, Light Industry District

Existing Use: Ball Park and Office/Warehouse

Proposed Use: Soccer Training Complex

ADJACENT LAND USE AND ZONING

5. *North: L-I, Light Industry District, Castrucci Chevrolet*
6. *South: East Fork of the Little Miami River*
7. *East: L-I, Light Industry District, Kellerman office/warehouse*
8. *West: L-I, Light Industry District, Rivers Edge Collision Center*

ANALYSIS

The Kleingers Group is requesting approval to construct two buildings totaling approximately 35,000 square feet and three soccer fields on the property located at 689 US 50. The site would be used for a soccer training facility for FC Cincinnati. The subject site consists of a total of 23.679 acres and consists of two parcels. Parcel #1: 210737.121P; zoned I, Institutional District and the former home of Expressway Ballpark. Parcel #2: #210737.127P would provide access into the site from US 50 and is zoned L-I, Light Industry.

Zoning

Parcel #1 is zoned I, Institutional District and Parcel #2 is zoned L-I, Light Industry. The proposed use as a soccer training facility is classified as a private recreational use according to the Milford Zoning Ordinance. This use is permitted in the Institutional District. The use located

on Parcel #2 is classified as Office and is permitted in the L-I District. Any future use to be located on the remaining area of land on Parcel #2 will need to comply with the Light Industry zoning district.

Demolition

The Demolition Plan, Sheet C3.0 in your site plan package, indicates that all structures will be demolished and removed on parcels #1 and 2. The applicant stated that the larger office/warehouse structure will be removed immediately to make way for the driveway into the site. The two smaller structures will be removed at a later date. Mr. Bob Owens, Expressway Park, applied and received approval for Demolition of all structures on Parcel #1 in July. A new Demolition permit will be required for removal of structures on Parcel #2.

Floodplain and WMSC (Water Management and Sediment Control)

The City Engineer serves as the Floodplain Administrator. He has reviewed the drawings and flood study submitted by Kleingers and has found that the documents are in compliance with Section 1319 of the Milford Codified Ordinance. (See attached)

Location Plan

The Site Plan, Sheet C4.0, illustrates the location of all structures and soccer fields. The site would be accessed from US 50. Access to the site would be controlled by gating off different sections of the parking areas. The Fire Department will need Knox Box access to all locked gates. There is an existing easement that runs through the Rivers Edge Collision Center property that would provide additional ingress/egress, but would be gated; the Fire Department requests that this easement be maintained and available in the event of an emergency.

Three buildings will be built on site. Initial construction will include a 29,366 square foot two-story team building for the use of players and staff. The second building will be used as a Developmental Academy and the third building on the southern edge of the property is a maintenance shed. The maximum allowable building height in the Institutional District is 45 feet.

The applicant is showing a 6-foot-high decorative fence to surround player parking and front portion of building. The decorative fence transitions to a standard chain link fence around the fields. Sheet C1.0 Details, indicates a 6-foot vinyl coated chain link fence. Although the applicant is providing a landscape buffer around the parking lot, the landscape is behind the fence. Staff would ask for clarification on the type of fence that is visible from US Route 50 around the player parking area.

A 500-seat bleacher is located on the west side of the site and would be available for use in the event that the team hosts daily practices for local teams and youth games on Saturday as well as regional high school soccer tournaments.

The applicant is providing 132 parking spaces. Forty-six spaces will be dedicated to player parking and the remainder will be used to support staff and visitors. Staff believes the parking spaces provided is adequate to meet the daily operational needs of the facility. Two dumpster locations are identified on the plan; one dumpster is located in the player parking area and the second dumpster is located to the rear of the property by the maintenance building. The dumpster in the front parking lot will need to be fully screened with a continuous planting of evergreen, fence or wall of earth.

Elevations

Sheet A0.0 shows the exterior renderings of the proposed facility. Additional building details have been supplied. (See attached A3.0 and 3.1) The Zoning Ordinance does not require specific building materials in the Institutional District, but it does specify that the maximum height for all structures shall not exceed 45 feet.

Traffic

The Zoning Ordinance specifies that a traffic impact study is required for any new development which will generate more than 100 new inbound or outbound trips during the peak hour. The Kleingers Group has provided a Traffic Evaluation (See attached) that includes a summary of anticipated peak hour traffic. Their evaluation indicates that the estimated trips during peak hours are expected to fall below the 100 new inbound and outbound trip threshold. The report indicates that a future traffic impact study may be necessary in the event that additional uses are proposed.

City Services

All City Departments have reviewed this proposal and believe that this site can be adequately served by City services without any detrimental impact to existing City service. (See attached)

Landscaping

Sheet L1.1 provides a recap of Milford Zoning Ordinance requirements and proposed plantings. It appears that the landscape plan area meets the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.

Lighting

The Milford Zoning Ordinance addresses Outdoor lighting in Section 1187.10, which states that all outdoor lighting shall be designed, located, and mounted at heights no greater than ten feet (10') above grad for non-cutoff lights and twenty-four feet (24') above grade for cutoff lights.

The site lighting plan, Sheet EL1.0 (Fixture Types A3 & A4), indicate a 30-foot pole height for lighting along the driveway and in the parking lots. Staff recommends that these light poles be reduced to the maximum allowable height specified in the Zoning Ordinance of 24 feet for full cutoff lights.

The applicant proposes to install stadium lighting on 70-foot-high poles. Although this pole height is in excess of allowable pole height, the Ordinance does not make allowances for a specific use such as stadium lighting. Sheet EL1.1, Photometric Lighting Plan, indicates that the applicant complies with the Zoning Ordinance requirement that footcandles at the property line be less than 0.5. Staff feels that the stadium lighting is appropriate for the use and since the applicant is able to comply with the maximum allowable footcandles at the property line no further approvals would be necessary unless Planning Commission indicates otherwise.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. City approval is contingent on review and approval by the City Engineer and any other applicable local, state, and federal agencies.
2. Future uses to be located on the remaining area of land on Parcel #2 will need to comply with the Light Industry zoning district.
3. Identify type of fence to enclose player parking area.

4. The Fire Department will need Knox Box access to all locked gates.
5. All structures shall not exceed 45 feet in height.
6. Lighting fixture types A3 & A4 to comply with Section 1187.10 of the Milford Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Wenstrup asked if the City has ever received complaints about Expressway Park light pollution. Ms. Holbrook stated she is not aware of any lighting complaints. One thing that needs to be clarified by the applicant is whether there is a cutoff time for the lighting. Mr. Roe stated that the Expressway Lights were very bright but would generally be shutoff at 11PM.

Brad D'Agnillo, Kleingers, stated there will be three MLS style practice fields. Two will be natural grass and one will be synthetic turf. Seventy-foot light poles will be used to light the fields. The proposed hours of operation are 6AM to Midnight. He stated it is possible that the lights could be on that whole time period depending on practices. There are approximately 150 parking spaces of which 50 are enclosed and will be dedicated to players and staff. The decorative fence surrounding the parking lot will be a vertical black picket fence.

Mr. D'Agnillo stated access to the site is from US 50. The entrance has been set at the crest of the hill on US 50 to help with the sight lines so drivers can turn left and right out of the driveway. Currently, the driveway located on US 50 is a right turn only when exiting. Mr. Wenstrup asked if anything was planned in the area near the East Fork of the Little Miami River. Mr. D'Agnillo stated the area is heavily wooded and nothing is planned for that area. Mr. D'Agnillo stated the fields will drain down to the river. Mr. Wenstrup asked if the fields will be treated with chemicals. Mr. D'Agnillo stated the chemicals that will be used on the field will be no different than a typical fertilizer; all three fields are graded to be completely flat and the two grass fields sit on 16" of USGA sand root system that acts as a filtration system. The synthetic turf sits on 8 inches of stone. Mr. Schmidt, MSA Architects, stated the chemicals being used on the fields are all EPA approved chemicals and the EPA has approved this method of draining the fields.

Mr. Roe questioned whether the building exceeded 45 feet in height. Mr. Schmidt stated no, the highest point on the building is 40 feet and that includes the parapet used to screen the mechanical equipment on the roof. He noted this building will serve as the day to day of home of FC Cincinnati. Players and coaches will arrive every morning and train. At night the site will switch over to support their youth academy training program. The Academy building has 3-4 small locker rooms for youth academy teams who will use the fields from 6PM on. Mr. Schmidt stated he believed the light pollution will be a lot less; they are going from 24 existing light poles to 6 light poles with new LED lights with a very specific cutoff. Mr. Schmidt stated they do not plan on leaving the lights on at night, but they do have the capability with a smaller light on the pole to provide 1 footcandle on the field which is enough light to see if someone is on the field.

Ms. Holbrook asked if they would like to comment on the height of the parking lot lights which shows a 30-foot tall light pole. The ordinance states a maximum pole height is 24 feet. Mr. Schmidt stated they can lower the height of the parking lot light pole to 24 feet. Mr. Wenstrup asked how many spectators the facility could hold. Mr. Schmidt stated that part of the facility is considered Phase 2 and would not be built until next year. The facility will hold approximately 500 seats which would be used for academy games. Mr. Wenstrup asked how many people/teams may be playing on the field at any one time. Mr. Schmidt stated that in the morning there will be 40-45 people on the field. In the evenings approximately 4 teams of 20 people or 80 people.

Mr. Schmidt stated there is no medical facility on site. If there is an emergency they would call 911. Ms. Holbrook noted the player parking area shows landscaping on the inside of the fence however, we would typically ask for the landscaping on the outside of the fence. Mr. Schmidt stated the reason for placing the landscaping inside the fence is to prevent someone from hiding behind the landscaping and jumping over the fence. That is the teams parking lot and the goal is to provide a secure location for their parking. Mr. Schmidt stated that landscaping is being provided between the FC property, the Castrucci property, and the east/west borders.

Ms. Holbrook stated that the sign shown on the plan needs to be 10 feet from the right of way; she noted all signage would be approved under a separate review and permit. Ms. Holbrook asked if the property owner intended to combine the properties. Mr. Schmidt stated FC does now own both properties and they do intend to combine them. Ms. McKnight noted that there are two different zoning districts currently and that wouldn't change unless they go through a rezoning process. Ms. Holbrook stated the zoning districts could impact a future use on the remaining land.

Mr. Wenstrup asked if the city anticipated making any alterations to the traffic patterns on US 50. Ms. Holbrook stated that no changes are proposed at the current time but could be addressed at a future date. Mr. D'Agnillo stated the traffic engineers have indicated that the intersection is adequate for the use since it was a ballpark prior to this proposed use.

Ms. McKnight asked if a condition should be added regarding hours of use for the field lights. The Commission agreed that an additional condition should be added which states light usage be limited to the hours between 6AM and Midnight. Mr. Pelle asked what time a typical evening game might end. Mr. D'Agnillo stated scrimmages could go until midnight.

Mr. Pelle made a motion to approve the site plan submittal with the following conditions:

1. City approval is contingent on review and approval by the City Engineer and any other applicable local, state, and federal agencies.
2. Future uses to be located on the remaining area of land on Parcel #2 will need to comply with the Light Industry zoning district.
3. Identify type of fence to enclose player parking area.
4. The Fire Department will need Knox Box access to all locked gates.
5. All structures shall not exceed 45 feet in height.
6. Lighting fixture types A3 & A4 to comply with Section 1187.10 of the Milford Zoning Ordinance.
7. Field light usage be limited to the hours between 6AM and Midnight.

Mr. Wenstrup seconded the motion. The motion was approved 4-0.

There being no further business or comments to come before the Planning Commission, Mr. Pelle made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:50 pm; seconded by Mr. Wenstrup. Following a unanimous decision, the ayes carried.


Assistant City Manager


Lois McKnight